Borrowing from Your Retirement

Barbara is 40 years old, has a child in college, and needs to take out a loan to help with tuition. She is considering either a home-equity loan or a loan from her 401(k), and is not sure which would be the better choice. She has heard that taking out a loan from a 401(k) is painless, since “you don’t pay penalties and pay the interest to yourself, not to a bank.” What should she do?

Many 401(k) plans offer a loan provision and the process is fairly easy. There is no credit check (since you are borrowing from yourself); the interest rate is usually low (maybe a percentage point or two above prime); you can generally borrow up to 50% of your vested account balance to a maximum of $50,000; you have up to five years to repay the loan (longer for loans used to purchase a primary residence), and the plan administrator usually deducts the loan payments automatically from your paycheck.

However, the real cost of borrowing from your 401(k) is not the rate you pay yourself in interest, but the amount you would have earned on your balance had you just left the money in the account. This is called an “opportunity cost,” and it can be significant. In addition, if Barbara loses or changes jobs, a 401(k) loan will most likely come “due in full” within a limited amount of time, while a home-equity loan will not. The balance is taxed as if it were ordinary income and, unless she is at least 59½ years old, failure to pay the 401(k) loan back by the due date triggers a 10% penalty.

So, what are Barbara’s choices? In general, if she can take out a home-equity loan at a lower after-tax cost than the return she expects to receive on her 401(k), she should choose the home-equity loan.